104th CONGRESS 2d Session

S. 942

AN ACT

- To promote increased understanding of Federal regulations and increased voluntary compliance with such regulations by small entities, to provide for the designation of regional ombudsmen and oversight boards to monitor the enforcement practices of certain Federal agencies with respect to small business concerns, to provide relief from excessive and arbitrary regulatory enforcement actions against small entities, and for other purposes.
 - 1 Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representa-
 - 2 tives of the United States of America in Congress assembled,

3 SECTION. 1. SHORT TITLE.

4 This Act may be cited as the "Small Business Regu-5 latory Enforcement Fairness Act of 1996".

1 SEC. 2. FINDINGS.

2 Congress finds that— 3 (1) a vibrant and growing small business sector 4 is critical to creating jobs in a dynamic economy; 5 (2) small businesses bear a disproportionate 6 share of regulatory costs and burdens; 7 (3) fundamental changes that are needed in the 8 regulatory and enforcement culture of Federal agen-9 cies to make agencies more responsive to small business can be made without compromising the statu-10 11 tory missions of the agencies; 12 (4) three of the top recommendations of the 13 White House Conference on Small Business involve 14 reforms to the way Government regulations are de-15 veloped and enforced, and reductions in Government 16 paperwork requirements; 17 (5) the requirements of the Regulatory Flexibil-18 ity Act have too often been ignored by Government 19 agencies, resulting in greater regulatory burdens on 20 small entities than necessitated by statute; and 21 (6) small entities should be given the oppor-22 tunity to seek judicial review of agency actions re-23 quired by the Regulatory Flexibility Act. 24 SEC. 3. PURPOSES. 25 The purposes of this Act are—

 $\mathbf{2}$

1	(1) to implement certain recommendations of
2	the 1995 White House Conference on Small Busi-
3	ness regarding the development and enforcement of
4	Federal regulations;
5	(2) to provide for judicial review of the Regu-
6	latory Flexibility Act;
7	(3) to encourage the effective participation of
8	small businesses in the Federal regulatory process;
9	(4) to simplify the language of Federal regula-
10	tions affecting small businesses;
11	(5) to develop more accessible sources of infor-
12	mation on regulatory and reporting requirements for
13	small businesses;
14	(6) to create a more cooperative regulatory en-
15	vironment among agencies and small businesses that
16	is less punitive and more solution-oriented; and
17	(7) to make Federal regulators more account-
18	able for their enforcement actions by providing small
19	entities with a meaningful opportunity for redress of
20	excessive enforcement activities.
21	SEC. 4. EFFECTIVE DATE.

This Act shall become effective on the date 90 daysafter enactment, except that the amendments made bytitle IV of this Act shall not apply to interpretive rules

for which a notice of proposed rulemaking was published
 prior to the date of enactment.

3 TITLE I—REGULATORY 4 COMPLIANCE SIMPLIFICATION

5 SEC. 101. DEFINITIONS.

6 For purposes of this Act—

7 (1) the terms "rule" and "small entity" have
8 the same meanings as in section 601 of title 5, Unit9 ed States Code;

10 (2) the term "agency" has the same meaning as
11 in section 551 of title 5, United States Code; and

12 (3) the term "small entity compliance guide"13 means a document designated as such by an agency.

14 SEC. 102. COMPLIANCE GUIDES.

15 (a) COMPLIANCE GUIDE.—For each rule or group of related rules for which an agency is required to prepare 16 17 a final regulatory flexibility analysis under section 604 of title 5, United States Code, the agency shall publish one 18 or more guides to assist small entities in complying with 19 the rule, and shall designate such publications as "small 20 21 entity compliance guides". The guides shall explain the ac-22 tions a small entity is required to take to comply with a 23 rule or group of rules. The agency shall, in its sole discre-24 tion, taking into account the subject matter of the rule 25 and the language of relevant statutes, ensure that the

4

guide is written using sufficiently plain language likely to
 be understood by affected small entities. Agencies may
 prepare separate guides covering groups or classes of simi larly affected small entities, and may cooperate with asso ciations of small entities to develop and distribute such
 guides.

7 (b) COMPREHENSIVE SOURCE OF INFORMATION.— 8 Agencies shall cooperate to make available to small enti-9 ties through comprehensive sources if information, the 10 small entity compliance guides and all other available in-11 formation on statutory and regulatory requirements af-12 fecting small entities.

13 (c) LIMITATION ON JUDICIAL REVIEW.—An agency's small entity compliance guide shall not be subject to judi-14 15 cial review, except that in any civil or administrative action against a small entity for a violation occurring after 16 17 the effective date of this section, the content of the small entity compliance guide may be considered as evidence of 18 the reasonableness or appropriateness of any proposed 19 20 fines, penalties or damages.

21 SEC. 103. INFORMAL SMALL ENTITY GUIDANCE.

(a) GENERAL.—Whenever appropriate in the interest
of administering statutes and regulations within the jurisdiction of an agency, it shall be the practice of the agency
to answer inquiries by small entities concerning informa-

tion on and advice about compliance with such statutes 1 2 and regulations, interpreting and applying the law to spe-3 cific sets of facts supplied by the small entity. In any civil 4 or administrative action against a small entity, guidance 5 given by an agency applying the law to facts provided by the small entity may be considered as evidence of the rea-6 7 sonableness or appropriateness of any proposed fines, pen-8 alties or damages sought against such small entity.

9 (b) PROGRAM.—Each agency regulating the activities 10 of small entities shall establish a program for responding 11 to such inquiries no later than 1 year after enactment of 12 this section, utilizing existing functions and personnel of 13 the agency to the extent practicable.

14SEC. 104. SERVICES OF SMALL BUSINESS DEVELOPMENT15CENTERS.

16 Section 21(c)(3) of the Small Business Act (15
17 U.S.C. 648(c)(3)) is amended—

18 (1) in subparagraph (O), by striking "and" at19 the end;

20 (2) in subparagraph (P), by striking the period21 at the end and inserting a semicolon; and

(3) by inserting after subparagraph (P) the fol-lowing new subparagraphs:

24 "(Q) providing assistance to small business
25 concerns regarding regulatory requirements, in-

1	cluding providing training with respect to cost-
2	effective regulatory compliance;
3	"(R) developing informational publications,
4	establishing resource centers of reference mate-
5	rials, and distributing compliance guides pub-
6	lished under section 102(a) of the Small Busi-
7	ness Regulatory Enforcement Fairness Act of
8	1996 to small business concerns; and
9	"(S) developing programs to provide con-
10	fidential onsite assessments and recommenda-
11	tions regarding regulatory compliance to small
12	business concerns and assisting small business
13	concerns in analyzing the business development
14	issues associated with regulatory implementa-
15	tion and compliance measures.".
16	SEC. 105. MANUFACTURING TECHNOLOGY CENTERS AND
17	PROGRAMS ESTABLISHED UNDER SECTION
18	507 OF THE CLEAN AIR ACT AMENDMENTS OF
19	1990.
20	(a) GENERAL.—The Manufacturing Technology Cen-
21	ters and other similar extension centers administered by
22	the National Institute of Standards and Technology of the
23	Department of Commerce shall, as appropriate, provide
24	the assistance regarding regulatory requirements, develop

and distribute information and guides and develop the

programs to provide confidential onsite assessments and
 recommendations regarding regulatory compliance to the
 same extent as provided for in section 104 of this Act with
 respect to Small Business Development Centers.

5 (b) SECTION 507 PROGRAMS.—Nothing in this Act 6 in any way limits the authority and operation of the small 7 business stationary source technical and environmental 8 compliance assistance programs established under section 9 507 of the Clean Air Act Amendments of 1990.

10 SEC. 106. COOPERATION ON GUIDANCE.

11 Agencies may, to the extent resources are available 12 and where appropriate, in cooperation with the States, de-13 velop guides that fully integrate requirements of both Federal and State regulations where regulations within an 14 15 agency's area of interest at the Federal and State levels impact small businesses. Where regulations vary among 16 the States, separate guides may be created for separate 17 States in cooperation with State agencies. 18

19 **TITLE II—REGULATORY**

20 ENFORCEMENT REFORMS

21 SEC. 201. SMALL BUSINESS AND AGRICULTURE ENFORCE-

22 MENT OMBUDSMAN.

The Small Business Act (15 U.S.C. 631 et seq.) is
amended—

1	(1) by redesignating section 30 as section 31;
2	and
3	(2) by inserting after section 29 the following
4	new section:
5	"SEC. 30. OVERSIGHT OF REGULATORY ENFORCEMENT.
6	"(a) DEFINITIONS.—For purposes of this section, the
7	term—
8	"(1) "Board" means a Regional Small Business
9	Regulatory Fairness Board established under sub-
10	section (c); and
11	"(2) "Ombudsman" means the Small Business
12	and Agriculture Regulatory Enforcement Ombuds-
13	man designated under subsection (b).
14	"(b) SBA Enforcement Ombudsman.—
15	"(1) Not later than 180 days after the date of
16	enactment of this section, the Administration shall
17	designate a Small Business and Agriculture Regu-
18	latory Enforcement Ombudsman utilizing personnel
19	of the Small Business Administration to the extent
20	practicable. Other agencies shall assist the Ombuds-
21	man and take actions as necessary to ensure compli-
22	ance with the requirements of this section. Nothing
23	in this section is intended to replace or diminish the
24	activities of any Ombudsman or similar office in any
25	other agency.

1 "(2) The Ombudsman shall—

"(A) work with each agency with regu-2 3 latory authority over small businesses to ensure that small business concerns that receive or are 4 5 subject to an audit, onsite inspection, compli-6 ance assistance effort, or other enforcement re-7 lated communication or contact by agency per-8 sonnel are provided with a means to comment 9 on the enforcement activity conducted by such 10 personnel;

11 "(B) establish means to receive comments 12 from small business concerns regarding actions 13 by agency employees conducting compliance or 14 enforcement activities with respect to the small 15 business concern, means to refer comments to 16 the Inspector General of the affected agency in 17 the appropriate circumstances, and otherwise 18 seek to maintain the identity of the person and 19 small business concern making such comments 20 on a confidential basis to the same extent as 21 employee identities are protected under section 22 7 of the Inspector General Act of 1978 (5 23 U.S.C. App.);

24 "(C) based on substantiated comments re-25 ceived from small business concerns and the

1	Boards, annually report to Congress and af-
2	fected agencies evaluating the enforcement ac-
3	tivities of agency personnel including a rating of
4	the responsiveness to small business of the var-
5	ious regional and program offices of each agen-
6	cy;
7	"(D) coordinate and report annually on the
8	activities, findings, and recommendations of the
9	Boards to the Administration and to the heads
10	of affected agencies; and
11	"(E) provide the affected agency with an
12	opportunity to comment on draft reports pre-
13	pared under paragraph (C) and include a sec-
14	tion of the final report in which the affected
15	agency may make such comments as are not
16	addressed by the Ombudsman in revisions to
17	the draft.
18	"(c) Regional Small Business Regulatory
19	Fairness Boards.—
20	((1) Not later than 180 days after the date of
21	enactment of this section, the Administration shall
22	establish a Small Business Regulatory Fairness
23	Board in each regional office of the Small Business
24	Administration.

1

"(2) Each Board established under paragraph

2	(1) shall—
3	"(A) meet at least annually to advise the
4	Ombudsman on matters of concern to small
5	businesses relating to the enforcement activities
6	of agencies;
7	"(B) report to the Ombudsman on sub-
8	stantiated instances of excessive enforcement
9	actions of agencies against small business con-
10	cerns including any findings or recommenda-
11	tions of the Board as to agency enforcement
12	policy or practice; and
13	"(C) prior to publication, provide comment
14	on the annual report of the Ombudsman pre-
15	pared under subsection (b).
16	"(3) Each Board shall consist of five members
17	appointed by the Administration, who are owners or
18	operators of small entities, after receiving the rec-
19	ommendations of the chair and ranking minority
20	member of the Committees on Small Business of the
21	House of Representatives and the Senate.
22	"(4) Members of the Board shall serve for
23	terms of three years or less.

1 "(5) The Administration shall select a chair 2 from among the members of the Board who shall 3 serve for not more than 2 years as chair. "(6) A majority of the members of the Board 4 5 shall constitute a quorum for the conduct of busi-6 ness, but a lesser number may hold hearings. 7 "(d) POWERS OF THE BOARDS.— "(1) The Board may hold such hearings and 8 9 collect such information as appropriate for carrying 10 out this section. 11 "(2) The Board may use the United States 12 mails in the same manner and under the same con-13 ditions as other departments and agencies of the 14 Federal Government. 15 "(3) The Board may accept donations of serv-16 ices necessary to conduct its business: *Provided*, 17 That the donations and their sources are disclosed 18 by the Board. 19 "(4) Members of the Board shall serve without 20 compensation: *Provided*, That members of the Board 21 shall be allowed travel expenses, including per diem 22 in lieu of subsistence, at rates authorized for em-23 ployees of agencies under subchapter I of chapter 57 24 of title 5, United States Code, while away from their homes or regular places of business in the perform ance of services for the Board.".

3 SEC. 202. RIGHTS OF SMALL ENTITIES IN ENFORCEMENT 4 ACTIONS.

5 (a) IN GENERAL.—Each agency regulating the activities of small entities shall establish a policy or program 6 7 within 1 year of enactment of this section to provide for 8 the reduction, and under appropriate circumstances for 9 the waiver, of civil penalties for violations of a statutory 10 or regulatory requirement by a small entity. Under appro-11 priate circumstances, an agency may consider ability to 12 pay in determining penalty assessments on small entities.

(b) CONDITIONS AND EXCLUSIONS.—Subject to the
requirements or limitations of other statutes, policies or
programs established under this section shall contain conditions or exclusions which may include, but shall not be
limited to—

18 (1) requiring the small entity to correct the vio-19 lation within a reasonable correction period;

20 (2) limiting the applicability to violations dis21 covered by the small entity through participation in
22 a compliance assistance or audit program operated
23 or supported by the agency or a State;

24 (3) excluding small entities that have been sub-25 ject to multiple enforcement actions by the agency;

(4) excluding violations involving willful or
 criminal conduct;

3 (5) excluding violations that pose serious
4 health, safety or environmental threats; and

5 (6) requiring a good faith effort to comply with6 the law.

7 (c) REPORTING.—Agencies shall report to Congress 8 no later than 2 years from the effective date on the scope 9 of their program or policy, the number of enforcement ac-10 tions against small entities that qualified or failed to qual-11 ify for the program or policy, and the total amount of pen-12 alty reductions and waivers.

13 TITLE III—EQUAL ACCESS TO

14 JUSTICE ACT AMENDMENTS

15 SEC. 301. ADMINISTRATIVE PROCEEDINGS.

16 Section 504 of title 5, United States Code, is amend17 ed—

(1) in subsection (b), by striking "\$75" in subparagraph (b)(1) and inserting "\$125"; and

20 (2) in subsection (a) by adding the following21 new paragraph:

"(4) In an adversary adjudication brought by
an agency, an adjudicative officer of the agency shall
award attorney's fees and other expenses to a party
or a small entity, as defined in section 601, if the

1 decision of the adjudicative officer is disproportion-2 ately less favorable to the agency than an express 3 demand by the agency, unless the party or small en-4 tity has committed a willful violation of law or other-5 wise acted in bad faith, or special circumstances 6 make an award of attorney's fees unjust. For pur-7 poses of this paragraph, an 'express demand' shall 8 not include a recitation by the agency of the maxi-9 mum statutory penalty (A) in the administrative 10 complaint, or (B) elsewhere when accompanied by an 11 express demand for a lesser amount. Fees and ex-12 penses awarded under this paragraph may not be 13 paid from the claims and judgments account of the 14 Treasury from funds appropriated pursuant to sec-15 tion 1304 of title 31, United States Code.".

16 SEC. 302. JUDICIAL PROCEEDINGS.

17 Section 2412 of title 28, United States Code, is18 amended—

(1) in paragraph (d), by striking "\$75" in subparagraph (2)(A) and inserting "\$125"; and

(2) in paragraph (d)(1) by adding the followingnew subparagraph:

23 "(D) In a civil action brought by the Unit24 ed States, a court shall award attorney's fees
25 and other expenses to a party or a small entity,

17

1

2 States Code, if the judgment finally obtained by 3 the United States is disproportionately less fa-4 vorable to the United States than an express 5 demand by the United States, unless the party 6 or small entity has committed a willful violation of law or otherwise acted in bad faith, or special 7 8 circumstances make an award of attorney's fees 9 unjust. For purposes of this subparagraph, an 10 'express demand' shall not include a recitation 11 of the maximum statutory penalty (i) in the 12 complaint, or (ii) elsewhere when accompanied 13 by an express demand for a lesser amount. Fees 14 and expenses awarded under this subparagraph 15 may not be paid from the claims and judgments 16 account of the Treasury from funds appro-17 priated pursuant to section 1304 of title 31, 18 United States Code.".

TITLE IV—REGULATORY 19

FLEXIBILITY ACT AMENDMENTS 20

21 SEC. 401. REGULATORY FLEXIBILITY ANALYSES.

22 (a) INITIAL REGULATORY FLEXIBILITY ANALYSIS.— 23 Section 603(a) of title 5, United States Code, is amended— 24

(1) by inserting after "proposed rule", the 2 phrase ", or publishes a notice of proposed rule-3 making for an interpretive rule involving the internal 4 revenue laws of the United States"; and

(2) by inserting at the end of the subsection, 5 6 the following new sentence: "In the case of an inter-7 pretive rule involving the internal revenue laws of 8 the United States, this chapter applies to interpre-9 tive rules published in the Federal Register for codi-10 fication in the Code of Federal Regulations, but only 11 to the extent that such interpretive rules impose on 12 small entities a collection of information require-13 ments, as defined in the Paperwork Reduction Act 14 of 1995.".

15 (b) FINAL REGULATORY FLEXIBILITY ANALYSIS.— Section 604 of title 5, United States Code, is amended— 16 17 (1) in subsection (a) to read as follows:

18 "(a) When an agency promulgates a final rule under section 553 of this title, after being required by that sec-19 tion or any other law to publish a general notice of pro-20 21 posed rulemaking, or is otherwise required to publish an 22 initial regulatory flexibility analysis, the agency shall pre-23 pare a final regulatory flexibility analysis. Each final regu-24 latory flexibility analysis shall contain—

1

"(1) a succinct statement of the need for, and
 objectives of, the rule;

"(2) a summary of the significant issues raised
by the public comments in response to the initial
regulatory flexibility analysis, a summary of the assessment of the agency of such issues, and a statement of any changes made in the proposed rule as
a result of such comments;

9 "(3) a description of and an estimate of the 10 number of small entities to which the rule will apply 11 or an explanation of why no such estimate is avail-12 able;

13 "(4) a description of the projected reporting, 14 record keeping and other compliance requirements of 15 the rule, including an estimate of the classes of 16 small entities which will be subject to the require-17 ment and the type of professional skills necessary 18 for preparation of the report or record; and

19 "(5) a description of the steps the agency has 20 taken to minimize the significant economic impact 21 on small entities consistent with the stated objectives 22 of applicable statutes, including a statement of the 23 factual, policy, and legal reasons for selecting the al-24 ternative adopted in the final rule and why each one 25 of the other significant alternatives to the rule considered by the agency which affect the impact on
 small business was rejected."; and

3 (2) in subsection (b), by striking "at the time"
4 and all that follows and inserting "such analysis or
5 a summary thereof.".

6 SEC. 402. JUDICIAL REVIEW.

7 Section 611 of title 5, United States Code, is amend-8 ed to read as follows:

9 "§611. Judicial review

"(a)(1) For any rule subject to this chapter, a small
entity that is adversely affected or aggrieved by final agency action is entitled to judicial review of agency compliance
with the requirements of this chapter, except the requirements of sections 602, 603, 609 and 612.

"(2) Each court having jurisdiction to review such
rule for compliance with section 553 of this title or under
any other provision of law shall have jurisdiction to review
any claims of noncompliance with this chapter, except the
requirements of sections 602, 603, 609 and 612.

"(3)(A) A small entity may seek such review during
the period beginning on the date of final agency action
and ending one year later, except that where a provision
of law requires that an action challenging a final agency
action be commenced before the expiration of one year,

such lesser period shall apply to a petition for judicial re view under this section.

3 "(B) In the case where an agency delays the issuance
4 of a final regulatory flexibility analysis pursuant to section
5 608(b) of this chapter, a petition for judicial review under
6 this section shall be filed not later than—

7 "(i) one year after the date the analysis is made8 available to the public, or

9 "(ii) where a provision of law requires that an 10 action challenging a final agency regulation be com-11 menced before the expiration of the one year period, 12 the number of days specified in such provision of law 13 that is after the date the analysis is made available 14 to the public.

15 "(4) If the court determines, on the basis of the rule-16 making record, that the final agency action under this 17 chapter was arbitrary, capricious, an abuse of discretion 18 or otherwise not in accordance with the law, the court 19 shall order the agency to take corrective action consistent 20 with this chapter, which may include—

21 "(A) remanding the rule to the agency, and

"(B) deferring the enforcement of the rule against
small entities, unless the court finds good cause for continuing the enforcement of the rule pending the completion
of the corrective action.

"(5) Nothing in this subsection shall be construed to
 limit the authority of any court to stay the effective date
 of any rule or provision thereof under any other provision
 of law or to grant any other relief in addition to the re quirements of this section.

6 "(b) In an action for the judicial review of a rule,
7 the regulatory flexibility analysis for such rule, including
8 an analysis prepared or corrected pursuant to paragraph
9 (a)(4), shall constitute part of the entire record of agency
10 action in connection with such review.

11 "(c) Except as otherwise required by this chapter, the 12 court shall apply the same standards of judicial review 13 that govern the review of agency findings under the stat-14 ute granting the agency authority to conduct a rule-15 making.

16 "(d) Compliance or noncompliance by an agency with
17 the provisions of this chapter shall be subject to judicial
18 review only in accordance with this section.

"(e) Nothing in this section bars judicial review of
any other impact statement or similar analysis required
by any other law if judicial review of such statement or
analysis is otherwise permitted by law.".

23 SEC. 403. TECHNICAL AND CONFORMING AMENDMENTS.

(a) Section 605(b) of title 5, United States Code, isamended to read as follows:

1 "(b) Sections 603 and 604 of this title shall not apply to any proposed or final rule if the head of the agency 2 3 certifies that the rule will not, if promulgated, have a sig-4 nificant economic impact on a substantial number of small 5 entities. If the head of the agency makes a certification under the preceding sentence, the agency shall publish 6 7 such certification in the Federal Register, at the time of 8 publication of general notice of proposed rulemaking for 9 the rule or at the time of publication of the final rule, 10 along with a statement providing the factual and legal rea-11 sons for such certification. The agency shall provide such 12 certification and statement to the Chief Counsel for Advo-13 cacy of the Small Business Administration.".

14 (b) Section 612 of title 5, United States Code, is15 amended—

(1) in subsection (a), by striking "the commit-16 17 tees on the Judiciary of the Senate and the House 18 of Representatives, the Select Committee on Small 19 Business of the Senate, and the Committee on Small 20 Business of the House of Representatives" and in-21 serting "the Committees on the Judiciary and Small 22 Business of the Senate and House of Representa-23 tives".

24 (2) in subsection (b), by striking "his views25 with respect to the" and inserting in lieu thereof,

	= 1
1	"his or her views with respect to compliance with
2	this chapter, the adequacy of the rulemaking record
3	with respect to small entities and the".
4	SEC. 404. SMALL BUSINESS ADVOCACY REVIEW PANELS.
5	(a) Small Business Outreach and Interagency
6	COORDINATION.—Section 609 of title 5, United States
7	Code, is amended—
8	(1) before "techniques," by inserting "the rea-
9	sonable use of";
10	(2) in paragraph (4), after "entities", by insert-
11	ing "including soliciting and receiving comments
12	over computer networks";
13	(3) by designating the current text as sub-
14	section (a); and
15	(4) by adding the following new subsection:
16	"(b) Prior to publication of an initial regulatory flexi-
17	bility analysis which a covered agency is required to con-
18	duct by this chapter—
19	"(1) a covered agency shall notify the Chief
20	Counsel for Advocacy of the Small Business Admin-
21	istration and provide the Chief Counsel with infor-
22	mation on the potential impacts of the proposed rule
23	on small entities and the type of small entities that
24	might be affected;

"(2) not later than 15 days after the date of receipt of the materials described in paragraph (1),
the Chief Counsel shall identify individuals representative of affected small entities for the purpose
of obtaining advice and recommendations from those
individuals about the potential impacts of the proposed rule;

8 "(3) the agency shall convene a review panel for 9 such rule consisting wholly of full-time Federal em-10 ployees of the office within the agency responsible 11 for carrying out the proposed rule, the Office of In-12 formation and Regulatory Affairs within the Office 13 of Management and Budget, and the Chief Counsel; 14 "(4) the panel shall review any material the 15 agency has prepared in connection with this chapter,

including any draft proposed rule, collect advice and
recommendations of the small entity representatives
identified by the agency after consultation with the
Chief Counsel, on issues related to subsections
603(b), paragraphs (3), (4) and (5) and 603(c);

21 "(5) not later than 60 days after the date a 22 covered agency convenes a review panel pursuant to 23 paragraph (3), the review panel shall report on the 24 comments of the small entity representatives and its 25 findings as to issues related to subsections 603(b), paragraphs (3), (4) and (5) and 603(c): *Provided*,
 That such report shall be made public as part of the
 rulemaking record; and

4 "(6) where appropriate, the agency shall modify
5 the proposed rule, the initial regulatory flexibility
6 analysis or the decision on whether an initial regu7 latory flexibility analysis is required.

8 "(c) Prior to publication of a final regulatory flexibil9 ity analysis that a covered agency is required by this chap10 ter to conduct—

"(1) an agency shall reconvene the review panel
established under paragraph (b)(3), or if no initial
regulatory flexibility analysis was published, undertake the actions described in paragraphs (b) (1)
through (3);

"(2) the panel shall review any material the
agency has prepared in connection with this chapter,
including any draft rule, collect the advice and recommendations of the small entity representatives
identified by the agency after consultation with the
Chief Counsel, on issues related to subsection
604(a), paragraphs (3), (4) and (5);

23 "(3) not later than 15 days after the date a
24 covered agency convenes a review panel pursuant to
25 paragraph (1), the review panel shall report on the

comments of the small entity representatives and its
 findings as to issues related to subsection 604(a),
 paragraphs (3), (4) and (5): *Provided*, That such re port shall be made public as part of the rulemaking
 record; and

6 "(4) where appropriate, the agency shall modify
7 the final rule, the final regulatory flexibility analysis
8 or the decision on whether a final regulatory flexibil9 ity analysis is required.

10 "(d) An agency may in its discretion apply sub-11 sections (b) and (c) to rules that the agency intends to 12 certify under subsection 605(b), but the agency believes 13 may have a greater than de minimis impact on a substan-14 tial number of small entities.

15 "(e) For purposes of this section, the term 'covered
16 agency' means the Environmental Protection Agency and
17 the Occupational Health and Safety Administration of the
18 Department of Labor.

"(f) The Chief Counsel for Advocacy, in consultation
with the individuals identified in paragraph (b)(2) and
with the Administrator of the Office of Information and
Regulatory Affairs within the Office of Management and
Budget, may waive the requirements of paragraphs (b)(3),
(b)(4), and (b)(5), and subsection (c) by including in the
rulemaking record a written finding, with reasons there-

for, that those requirements would not advance the effec tive participation of small entities in the rulemaking proc ess. For purposes of this subsection, the factors to be con sidered in making such a finding are as follows—

5 "(1) in developing a proposed rule, the extent 6 to which the covered agency consulted with individ-7 uals representative of affected small entities with re-8 spect to the potential impacts of the rule and took 9 such concerns into consideration; or in developing a 10 final rule, the extent to which the covered agency 11 took into consideration the comments filed by the in-12 dividuals identified in paragraph (b)(2);

13 "(2) special circumstances requiring prompt is-14 suance of the rule; and

"(3) whether the requirements of subsection (b)
or (c) would provide the individuals identified in
subsection (b)(2) with a competitive advantage relative to other small entities.".

(b) SMALL BUSINESS ADVOCACY CHAIRPERSONS.—
Not later than 30 days after the date of enactment of this
Act, the head of each agency that has conducted a final
regulatory flexibility analysis shall designate a small business advocacy chairperson using existing personnel to the
extent possible, to be responsible for implementing this

section and to act as permanent chair of the agency's re view panels established pursuant to this section.

3 TITLE V—CONGRESSIONAL 4 REVIEW

5 SEC. 501. SHORT TITLE.

6 This title may be cited as the "Congressional Review7 Act of 1996".

8 SEC. 502. FINDING.

9 The Congress finds that effective steps for improving 10 the efficiency and proper management of Government op-11 erations will be promoted if a moratorium on the effective-12 ness of certain significant final rules is imposed in order 13 to provide Congress an opportunity for review.

14 SEC. 503. MORATORIUM ON REGULATIONS; CONGRES-15SIONAL REVIEW.

16 (a) REPORTING AND REVIEW OF REGULATIONS.—

17 (1) REPORTING TO CONGRESS AND THE COMP18 TROLLER GENERAL.—

(A) Before a rule can take effect as a final
rule, the Federal agency promulgating such rule
shall submit to each House of the Congress and
to the Comptroller General a report containing—

(i) a copy of the rule;

1	(ii) a concise general statement relat-
2	ing to the rule; and
3	(iii) the proposed effective date of the
4	rule.
5	(B) The Federal agency promulgating the
6	rule shall make available to each House of Con-
7	gress and the Comptroller General, upon re-
8	quest—
9	(i) a complete copy of the cost-benefit
10	analysis of the rule, if any;
11	(ii) the agency's actions relevant to
12	section 603, section 604, section 605, sec-
13	tion 607, and section 609 of Public Law
14	96-354;
15	(iii) the agency's actions relevant to
16	title II, section 202, section 203, section
17	204, and section 205 of Public Law 104–
18	4; and
19	(iv) any other relevant information or
20	requirements under any other Act and any
21	relevant Executive Orders, such as Execu-
22	tive Order 12866.
23	(C) Upon receipt, each House shall provide
24	copies to the Chairman and Ranking Member of
25	each committee with jurisdiction.

31

(A) The Comptroller General shall provide 3 4 a report on each significant rule to the commit-5 tees of jurisdiction to each House of the Con-6 gress by the end of 12 calendar days after the 7 submission or publication date as provided in 8 section 504(b)(2). The report of the Comptrol-9 ler General shall include an assessment of the 10 agency's compliance with procedural steps re-11 quired by subparagraph (B) (i) through (iv). 12 (B) Federal agencies shall cooperate with 13 the Comptroller General by providing informa-14 tion relevant to the Comptroller General's re-15 port under paragraph (2)(A) of this section. 16 (3)EFFECTIVE DATE OF SIGNIFICANT 17 RULES.—A significant rule relating to a report sub-18 mitted under paragraph (1) shall take effect as a 19 final rule, the latest of—

20 (A) the later of the date occurring 45 days
21 after the date on which—
22 (i) the Congress receives the report

23 submitted under paragraph (1); or

24 (ii) the rule is published in the Fed-25 eral Register;

1	(B) if the Congress passes a joint resolu-
2	tion of disapproval described under section 504
3	relating to the rule, and the President signs a
4	veto of such resolution, the earlier date—
5	(i) on which either House of Congress
6	votes and fails to override the veto of the
7	President; or
8	(ii) occurring 30 session days after
9	the date on which the Congress received
10	the veto and objections of the President; or
11	(C) the date the rule would have otherwise
12	taken effect, if not for this section (unless a
13	joint resolution of disapproval under section
14	504 is enacted).
15	(4) Effective date for other rules.—Ex-
16	cept for a significant rule, a rule shall take effect as
17	otherwise provided by law after submission to Con-
18	gress under paragraph (1).
19	(5) FAILURE OF JOINT RESOLUTION OF DIS-
20	APPROVAL.—Notwithstanding the provisions of para-
21	graph (3), the effective date of a rule shall not be
22	delayed by operation of this title beyond the date on
23	which either House of Congress votes to reject a
24	joint resolution of disapproval under section 504.

(b) TERMINATION OF DISAPPROVED RULEMAKING.—
 A rule shall not take effect (or continue) as a final rule,
 if the Congress passes a joint resolution of disapproval de scribed under section 504.

5 (c) Presidential Waiver Authority.—

6 (1) PRESIDENTIAL DETERMINATIONS.—Not-7 withstanding any other provision of this section (ex-8 cept subject to paragraph (3)), a rule that would not 9 take effect by reason of this title may take effect, if 10 the President makes a determination under para-11 graph (2) and submits written notice of such deter-12 mination to the Congress.

(2) GROUNDS FOR DETERMINATIONS.—Paragraph (1) applies to a determination made by the
President by Executive order that the rule should
take effect because such rule is—

17 (A) necessary because of an imminent
18 threat to health or safety or other emergency;
19 (B) necessary for the enforcement of crimi20 nal laws; or

21 (C) necessary for national security.
22 (3) WAIVER NOT TO AFFECT CONGRESSIONAL
23 DISAPPROVALS.—An exercise by the President of the
24 authority under this subsection shall have no effect

on the procedures under section 504 or the effect of
 a joint resolution of disapproval under this section.
 (d) TREATMENT OF RULES ISSUED AT END OF CON GRESS.—

5 (1) Additional opportunity for review.— 6 In addition to the opportunity for review otherwise 7 provided under this title, in the case of any rule that 8 is published in the Federal Register (as a rule that 9 shall take effect as a final rule) during the period 10 beginning on the date occurring 60 days before the 11 date the Congress adjourns sine die through the 12 date on which the succeeding Congress first con-13 venes, section 504 shall apply to such rule in the 14 succeeding Congress.

- 15 (2) TREATMENT UNDER SECTION 504.—
- 16 (A) In applying section 504 for purposes of
 17 such additional review, a rule described under
 18 paragraph (1) shall be treated as though—
- (i) such rule were published in the
 Federal Register (as a rule that shall take
 effect as a final rule) on the 15th session
 day after the succeeding Congress first
 convenes; and

1	(ii) a report on such rule were submit-
2	ted to Congress under subsection $(a)(1)$ on
3	such date.
4	(B) Nothing in this paragraph shall be
5	construed to affect the requirement under sub-
6	section $(a)(1)$ that a report must be submitted
7	to Congress before a final rule can take effect.
8	(3) Actual effective date not af-
9	FECTED.—A rule described under paragraph (1)
10	shall take effect as a final rule as otherwise provided
11	by law (including other subsections of this section).

12 (e) TREATMENT OF RULES ISSUED BEFORE THIS13 TITLE.—

(1) OPPORTUNITY FOR CONGRESSIONAL REVIEW.—The provisions of section 504 shall apply to
any significant rule that is published in the Federal
Register (as a rule that shall take effect as a final
rule) during the period beginning on March 1, 1996,
through the date on which this title takes effect.

20 (2) TREATMENT UNDER SECTION 504.—In ap21 plying section 504 for purposes of Congressional re22 view, a rule described under paragraph (1) shall be
23 treated as though—

24 (A) such rule were published in the Fed-25 eral Register (as a rule that shall take effect as

1 a final rule) on the date of the enactment of 2 this Act; and 3 (B) a report on such rule were submitted 4 to Congress under subsection (a)(1) on such 5 date. 6 (3)ACTUAL EFFECTIVE DATE NOT AF-7 FECTED.—The effectiveness of a rule described 8 under paragraph (1) shall be as otherwise provided 9 by law, unless the rule is made of no force or effect 10 under section 504. 11 (f) NULLIFICATION OF RULES DISAPPROVED BY

12 CONGRESS.—Any rule that takes effect and later is made
13 of no force or effect by the enactment of a joint resolution
14 under section 504 shall be treated as though such rule
15 had never taken effect.

16 (g) NO INFERENCE TO BE DRAWN WHERE RULES 17 NOT DISAPPROVED.—If the Congress does not enact a 18 joint resolution of disapproval under section 504, no court 19 or agency may infer any intent of the Congress from any 20 action or inaction of the Congress with regard to such 21 rule, related statute, or joint resolution of disapproval.

22 SEC. 504. CONGRESSIONAL DISAPPROVAL PROCEDURE.

(a) JOINT RESOLUTION DEFINED.—For purposes of
this section, the term "joint resolution" means only a joint
resolution introduced during the period beginning on the

8 (b) Referral.—

9 (1) IN GENERAL.—A resolution described in 10 paragraph (1) shall be referred to the committees in 11 each House of Congress with jurisdiction. Such a 12 resolution may not be reported before the eighth day 13 after its submission or publication date.

14 (2) SUBMISSION DATE.—For purposes of this
15 subsection the term "submission or publication
16 date" means the later of the date on which—

17 (A) the Congress receives the report sub18 mitted under section 503(a)(1); or

19 (B) the rule is published in the Federal20 Register.

(c) DISCHARGE.—If the committee to which is referred a resolution described in subsection (a) has not reported such resolution (or an identical resolution) at the
end of 20 calendar days after the submission or publication date defined under subsection (b)(2), such committee

may be discharged from further consideration of such res-1 2 olution in the Senate upon a petition supported in writing 3 by 30 Members of the Senate and in the House upon a 4 petition supported in writing by one-fourth of the Mem-5 bers duly sworn and chosen or by motion of the Speaker supported by the Minority Leader, and such resolution 6 7 shall be placed on the appropriate calendar of the House 8 involved.

9 (d) FLOOR CONSIDERATION.—

10 (1) IN GENERAL.—When the committee to 11 which a resolution is referred has reported, or when 12 a committee is discharged (under subsection (c)) 13 from further consideration of, a resolution described 14 in subsection (a), it is at any time thereafter in 15 order (even though a previous motion to the same 16 effect has been disagreed to) for a motion to proceed 17 to the consideration of the resolution, and all points 18 of order against the resolution (and against consid-19 eration of resolution) are waived. The motion is not 20 subject to amendment, or to a motion to postpone, 21 or to a motion to proceed to the consideration of 22 other business. A motion to reconsider the vote by 23 which the motion is agreed to or disagreed to shall 24 not be in order. If a motion to proceed to the consid-25 eration of the resolution is agreed to, the resolution

shall remain the unfinished business of the respec tive House until disposed of.

3 (2) DEBATE.—Debate on the resolution, and on all debatable motions and appeals in connection 4 5 therewith, shall be limited to not more than 10 6 hours, which shall be divided equally between those 7 favoring and those opposing the resolution. A motion 8 further to limit debate is in order and not debatable. 9 An amendment to, or a motion to postpone, or a mo-10 tion to proceed to the consideration of other busi-11 ness, or a motion to recommit the resolution is not 12 in order.

(3) FINAL PASSAGE.—Immediately following
the conclusion of the debate on a resolution described in subsection (a), and a single quorum call
at the conclusion of the debate if requested in accordance with the rules of the appropriate House,
the vote on final passage of the resolution shall
occur.

(4) APPEALS.—Appeals from the decisions of
the Chair relating to the application of the rules of
the Senate or the House of Representatives, as the
case may be, to the procedure relating to a resolution described in subsection (a) shall be decided
without debate.

39

1	(e) TREATMENT IF OTHER HOUSE HAS ACTED.—If,
2	before the passage by one House of a resolution of that
3	House described in subsection (a), that House receives
4	from the other House a resolution described in subsection
5	(a), then the following procedures shall apply:
6	(1) Nonreferral.—The resolution of the
7	other House shall not be referred to a committee.
8	(2) FINAL PASSAGE.—With respect to a resolu-
9	tion described in subsection (a) of the House receiv-
10	ing the resolution—
11	(A) the procedure in that House shall be
12	the same as if no resolution had been received
13	from the other House; but
14	(B) the vote on final passage shall be on
15	the resolution of the other House.
16	(f) CONSTITUTIONAL AUTHORITY.—This section is
17	enacted by Congress—
18	(1) as an exercise of the rulemaking power of
19	the Senate and House of Representatives, respec-
20	tively, and as such it is deemed a part of the rules
21	of each House, respectively, but applicable only with
22	respect to the procedure to be followed in that
23	House in the case of a resolution described in sub-
24	section (a), and it supersedes other rules only to the
25	extent that it is inconsistent with such rules; and

(2) with full recognition of the constitutional
 right of either House to change the rules (so far as
 relating to the procedure of that House) at any time,
 in the same manner, and to the same extent as in
 the case of any other rule of that House.

6 SEC. 505. SPECIAL RULE ON STATUTORY, REGULATORY 7 AND JUDICIAL DEADLINES.

8 (a) IN GENERAL.—In the case of any deadline for, 9 relating to, or involving any rule which does not take effect 10 (or the effectiveness of which is terminated) because of the enactment of a joint resolution under section 504, that 11 12 deadline is extended until the date 12 months after the 13 date of the joint resolution. Nothing in this subsection shall be construed to affect a deadline merely by reason 14 15 of the postponement of a rule's effective date under section 503(a). 16

(b) DEADLINE DEFINED.—The term "deadline"
means any date certain for fulfilling any obligation or exercising any authority established by or under any Federal
statute or regulation, or by or under any court order implementing any Federal statute or regulation.

22 SEC. 506. DEFINITIONS.

23 For purposes of this title—

24 (1) FEDERAL AGENCY.—The term "Federal
25 agency" means any "agency" as that term is defined

	12
1	in section $551(1)$ of title 5, United States Code (re-
2	lating to administrative procedure).
3	(2) SIGNIFICANT RULE.—The term "significant
4	rule"—
5	(A) means any final rule that the Adminis-
6	trator of the Office of Information and Regu-
7	latory Affairs within the Office of Management
8	and Budget finds—
9	(i) has an annual effect on the econ-
10	omy of \$100,000,000 or more or adversely
11	affects in a material way the economy, a
12	sector of the economy, productivity, com-
13	petition, jobs, the environment, public
14	health or safety, or State, local, or tribal
15	governments or communities;
16	(ii) creates a serious inconsistency or
17	otherwise interferes with an action taken
18	or planned by another agency;
19	(iii) materially alters the budgetary
20	impact of entitlement, grants, user fees, or
21	loan programs or the rights and obliga-
22	tions of recipients thereof; or
23	(iv) raises novel legal or policy issues
24	arising out of legal mandates, the Presi-

dent's priorities, or the principles set forth
in Executive Order 12866; and
(B) shall not include any rule promulgated
under the Telecommunications Act of 1996 and
the amendments made by such Act.
(3) FINAL RULE.—The term "final rule" means
any final rule or interim final rule. As used in this
paragraph, "rule" has the meaning given such term
by section 551 of title 5, United States Code, except
that such term does not include any rule of particu-
lar applicability including a rule that approves or
prescribes for the future rates, wages, prices, serv-
ices, or allowances therefor, corporate or financial
structures, reorganizations, mergers, or acquisitions
thereof, or accounting practices or disclosures bear-
ing on any of the foregoing or any rule of agency or-
ganization, personnel, procedure, practice or any
routine matter.

19 SEC. 507. JUDICIAL REVIEW.

20 No determination, finding, action, or omission under21 this title shall be subject to judicial review.

22 SEC. 508. APPLICABILITY; SEVERABILITY.

23 (a) APPLICABILITY.—This title shall apply notwith-24 standing any other provision of law.

1 (b) SEVERABILITY.—If any provision of this title, or 2 the application of any provision of this title to any person 3 or circumstance, is held invalid, the application of such 4 provision to other persons or circumstances, and the re-5 mainder of this title, shall not be affected thereby.

6 SEC. 509. EXEMPTION FOR MONETARY POLICY.

Nothing in this title shall apply to rules that concern
monetary policy proposed or implemented by the Board
of Governors of the Federal Reserve System or the Federal Open Market Committee.

11 SEC. 510. EXEMPTION FOR HUNTING AND FISHING.

12 Nothing in this title shall apply to rules that estab-13 lish, modify, open, close, or conduct a regulatory program 14 for a commercial, recreational, or subsistence activity re-15 lating to hunting, fishing, or camping.

16 SEC. 511. EFFECTIVE DATE.

17 This title shall take effect on the date of the enact-18 ment of this Act and shall apply to any rule that takes19 effect as a final rule on or after such effective date.

Passed the Senate March 19, 1996.

Attest:

Secretary.

104TH CONGRESS S. 942

AN ACT

To promote increased understanding of Federal regulations and increased voluntary compliance with such regulations by small entities, to provide for the designation of regional ombudsmen and oversight boards to monitor the enforcement practices of certain Federal agencies with respect to small business concerns, to provide relief from excessive and arbitrary regulatory enforcement actions against small entities, and for other purposes.