H. R. 2592

To enhance transparency and accountability for online political advertisements by requiring those who purchase and publish such ads to disclose information about the advertisements to the public, and for other purposes.

IN THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

May 8, 2019

Mr. Kilmer (for himself, Ms. Stefanik, Mr. Sarbanes, Mr. Fitzpatrick, Miss Rice of New York, Mr. Gallagher, Mr. Crist, Mr. Katko, Mr. Suozzi, Ms. Herrera Beutler, Mr. Panetta, Mr. Duffy, Mr. Schneider, Mr. Diaz-Balart, Mr. Costa, Mr. McKinley, Mr. Phillips, Mr. Fortenberry, Mr. Peters, Miss González-Colón of Puerto Rico, Mr. Smith of Washington, Mr. Bacon, Mr. Schrader, Mr. Stauber, Mr. Luján, and Mr. Gonzalez of Ohio) introduced the following bill; which was referred to the Committee on House Administration

A BILL

To enhance transparency and accountability for online political advertisements by requiring those who purchase and publish such ads to disclose information about the advertisements to the public, and for other purposes.

- 1 Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representa-
- 2 tives of the United States of America in Congress assembled,
- 3 SECTION 1. SHORT TITLE.
- This Act may be cited as the "Honest Ads Act".

1 SEC. 2. PURPOSE.

- 2 The purpose of this Act is to enhance the integrity
- 3 of American democracy and national security by improving
- 4 disclosure requirements for online political advertisements
- 5 in order to uphold the United States Supreme Court's
- 6 well-established standard that the electorate bears the
- 7 right to be fully informed.

8 SEC. 3. FINDINGS.

- Congress makes the following findings:
- 10 (1) On April 18, 2019, Special Counsel Robert
- Mueller released a report titled "Report on the In-
- vestigation into Russian Interference in the 2016
- 13 Presidential Election" which concluded that "the
- Russian government interfered in the 2016 presi-
- dential election in sweeping and systemic fashion.".
- The report details that Russia interfered in the 2016
- presidential election principally through two oper-
- ations: first, through a Russian government spon-
- sored social media influence campaign, and second,
- 20 by Russian intelligence "computer-intrusion" oper-
- 21 ations against those associated with both presi-
- dential campaigns.
- 23 (2) On September 6, 2017, the Nation's largest
- social media platform disclosed that between June
- 25 2015 and May 2017, Russian entities purchased
- \$100,000 in political advertisements, publishing

- roughly 3,000 ads linked to fake accounts associated with the Internet Research Agency, a pro-Kremlin organization. According to the company, the ads purchased focused "on amplifying divisive social and political messages . . .".
 - (3) In 2002, the Bipartisan Campaign Reform Act became law, establishing disclosure requirements for political advertisements distributed from a television or radio broadcast station or provider of cable or satellite television. In 2003, the Supreme Court upheld regulations on electioneering communications established under the Act, noting that such requirements "provide the electorate with information and insure that the voters are fully informed about the person or group who is speaking.".
 - (4) According to a study from Borrell Associates, in 2016, \$1,415,000,000 was spent on online advertising, more than quadruple the amount in 2012.
 - (5) The reach of a few large internet platforms—larger than any broadcast, satellite, or cable provider—has greatly facilitated the scope and effectiveness of disinformation campaigns. For instance, the largest platform has over 210,000,000 American users—over 160,000,000 of them on a daily basis.

- By contrast, the largest cable television provider has 22,430,000 subscribers, while the largest satellite television provider has 21,000,000 subscribers. And the most-watched television broadcast in U.S. history had 118,000,000 viewers.
 - (6) The public nature of broadcast television, radio, and satellite ensures a level of publicity for any political advertisement. These communications are accessible to the press, fact-checkers, and political opponents; this creates strong disincentives for a candidate to disseminate materially false, inflammatory, or contradictory messages to the public. Social media platforms, in contrast, can target portions of the electorate with direct, ephemeral advertisements often on the basis of private information the platform has on individuals, enabling political advertisements that are contradictory, racially or socially inflammatory, or materially false.
 - (7) According to comScore, 2 companies own 8 of the 10 most popular smartphone applications as of June 2017, including the most popular social media and email services—which deliver information and news to users without requiring proactivity by the user. Those same 2 companies accounted for 99 percent of revenue growth from digital advertising in

- 2016, including 77 percent of gross spending. Seventy-nine percent of online Americans—representing 68 percent of all Americans—use the single largest social network, while 66 percent of these users are most likely to get their news from that site.
 - (8) In its 2006 rulemaking, the Federal Election Commission noted that only 18 percent of all Americans cited the internet as their leading source of news about the 2004 Presidential election; by contrast, the Pew Research Center found that 65 percent of Americans identified an internet-based source as their leading source of information for the 2016 election.
 - (9) The Federal Election Commission, the independent Federal agency charged with protecting the integrity of the Federal campaign finance process by providing transparency and administering campaign finance laws, has failed to take action to address online political advertisements.
 - (10) In testimony before the Senate Select Committee on Intelligence titled, "Disinformation: A Primer in Russian Active Measures and Influence Campaigns," multiple expert witnesses testified that while the disinformation tactics of foreign adversaries have not necessarily changed, social media

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

services now provide "platform[s] practically purpose-built for active measures[.]" Similarly, as Gen. (RET) Keith B. Alexander, the former Director of the National Security Agency, testified, during the Cold War "if the Soviet Union sought to manipulate information flow, it would have to do so principally through its own propaganda outlets or through active measures that would generate specific news: planting of leaflets, inciting of violence, creation of other false materials and narratives. But the news itself was hard to manipulate because it would have required actual control of the organs of media, which took long-term efforts to penetrate. Today, however, because the clear majority of the information on social media sites is uncurated and there is a rapid proliferation of information sources and other sites that can reinforce information, there is an increasing likelihood that the information available to average consumers may be inaccurate (whether intentionally or otherwise) and may be more easily manipulable than in prior eras.".

(11) Current regulations on political advertisements do not provide sufficient transparency to uphold the public's right to be fully informed about political advertisements made online.

SEC. 4. SENSE OF CONGRESS.

| 2 | It is | the | sense | of | Congress | that— |
|---|-------|------|--------|------------------|----------|--------|
| _ | 10 10 | ULIC | SOLIDO | $O_{\mathbf{L}}$ | Congress | ULLUUU |

- 1 (1) the dramatic increase in digital political advertisements, and the growing centrality of online platforms in the lives of Americans, requires the Congress and the Federal Election Commission to take meaningful action to ensure that laws and regulations provide the accountability and transparency that is fundamental to our democracy;
 - (2) free and fair elections require both transparency and accountability which give the public a right to know the true sources of funding for political advertisements in order to make informed political choices and hold elected officials accountable; and
- 16 (3) transparency of funding for political adver-17 tisements is essential to enforce other campaign fi-18 nance laws, including the prohibition on campaign 19 spending by foreign nationals.

20 SEC. 5. EXPANSION OF DEFINITION OF PUBLIC COMMU-

21 **NICATION.**

10

11

12

13

14

- 22 (a) In General.—Paragraph (22) of section 301 of
- 23 the Federal Election Campaign Act of 1971 (52 U.S.C.
- 24 30101(22)) is amended by striking "or satellite commu-
- 25 nication" and inserting "satellite, paid internet, or paid
- 26 digital communication".

| 1 | (b) Treatment of Contributions and Expendi- |
|----|---|
| 2 | TURES.—Section 301 of such Act (52 U.S.C. 30101) is |
| 3 | amended— |
| 4 | (1) in paragraph (8)(B)— |
| 5 | (A) by striking "on broadcasting stations, |
| 6 | or in newspapers, magazines, or similar types of |
| 7 | general public political advertising" in clause |
| 8 | (v) and inserting "in any public communica- |
| 9 | tion"; |
| 10 | (B) by striking "broadcasting, newspaper, |
| 11 | magazine, billboard, direct mail, or similar type |
| 12 | of general public communication or political ad- |
| 13 | vertising" in clause (ix)(1) and inserting "pub- |
| 14 | lie communication"; and |
| 15 | (C) by striking "but not including the use |
| 16 | of broadcasting, newspapers, magazines, bill- |
| 17 | boards, direct mail, or similar types of general |
| 18 | public communication or political advertising" |
| 19 | in clause (x) and inserting "but not including |
| 20 | use in any public communication"; and |
| 21 | (2) in paragraph (9)(B)— |
| 22 | (A) by striking clause (i) and inserting the |
| 23 | following: |
| 24 | "(i) any news story, commentary, or |
| 25 | editorial distributed through the facilities |

1 of any broadcasting station or any print, 2 online, or digital newspaper, magazine, 3 blog, publication, or periodical, unless such 4 broadcasting, print, online, or digital facili-5 ties are owned or controlled by any polit-6 ical party, political committee, or can-7 didate;"; and (B) by striking "on broadcasting stations, 8 9 or in newspapers, magazines, or similar types of 10 general public political advertising" in clause 11 (iv) and inserting "in any public communica-12 tion".

- 13 (c) DISCLOSURE AND DISCLAIMER STATEMENTS.—
 14 Subsection (a) of section 318 of such Act (52 U.S.C.
 15 30120) is amended—
- 16 (1) by striking "financing any communication 17 through any broadcasting station, newspaper, maga-18 zine, outdoor advertising facility, mailing, or any 19 other type of general public political advertising" 20 and inserting "financing any public communication"; 21 and
 - (2) by striking "solicits any contribution through any broadcasting station, newspaper, magazine, outdoor advertising facility, mailing, or any other type of general public political advertising"

22

23

24

| 1 | and inserting "solicits any contribution through any |
|----|--|
| 2 | public communication". |
| 3 | SEC. 6. EXPANSION OF DEFINITION OF ELECTIONEERING |
| 4 | COMMUNICATION. |
| 5 | (a) Expansion to Online Communications.— |
| 6 | (1) Application to qualified internet and |
| 7 | DIGITAL COMMUNICATIONS.— |
| 8 | (A) IN GENERAL.—Subparagraph (A) of |
| 9 | section 304(f)(3) of the Federal Election Cam- |
| 10 | paign Act of 1971 (52 U.S.C. 30104(f)(3)(A)) |
| 11 | is amended by striking "or satellite communica- |
| 12 | tion" each place it appears in clauses (i) and |
| 13 | (ii) and inserting "satellite, or qualified internet |
| 14 | or digital communication". |
| 15 | (B) Qualified internet or digital |
| 16 | COMMUNICATION.—Paragraph (3) of section |
| 17 | 304(f) of such Act (52 U.S.C. 30104(f)) is |
| 18 | amended by adding at the end the following |
| 19 | new subparagraph: |
| 20 | "(D) QUALIFIED INTERNET OR DIGITAL |
| 21 | COMMUNICATION.—The term 'qualified internet |
| 22 | or digital communication' means any commu- |
| 23 | nication which is placed or promoted for a fee |
| 24 | on an online platform (as defined in subsection |
| 25 | (i)(3)).". |

| 1 | (2) Nonapplication of relevant elec- |
|----|--|
| 2 | TORATE TO ONLINE COMMUNICATIONS.—Section |
| 3 | 304(f)(3)(A)(i)(III) of such Act (52 U.S.C. |
| 4 | 30104(f)(3)(A)(i)(III)) is amended by inserting "any |
| 5 | broadcast, cable, or satellite" before "communica- |
| 6 | tion". |
| 7 | (3) News Exemption.—Section |
| 8 | 304(f)(3)(B)(i) of such Act (52 U.S.C. |
| 9 | 30104(f)(3)(B)(i)) is amended to read as follows: |
| 10 | "(i) a communication appearing in a |
| 11 | news story, commentary, or editorial dis- |
| 12 | tributed through the facilities of any |
| 13 | broadcasting station or any online or dig- |
| 14 | ital newspaper, magazine, blog, publica- |
| 15 | tion, or periodical, unless such broad- |
| 16 | casting, online, or digital facilities are |
| 17 | owned or controlled by any political party, |
| 18 | political committee, or candidate;". |
| 19 | (b) Effective Date.—The amendments made by |
| 20 | this section shall apply with respect to communications |
| 21 | made on or after January 1, 2020. |
| 22 | SEC. 7. APPLICATION OF DISCLAIMER STATEMENTS TO ON- |
| 23 | LINE COMMUNICATIONS. |
| 24 | (a) Clear and Conspicuous Manner Require- |
| 25 | MENT.—Subsection (a) of section 318 of the Federal Elec- |

tion Campaign Act of 1971 (52 U.S.C. 30120(a)) is 2 amended— 3 (1) by striking "shall clearly state" each place 4 it appears in paragraphs (1), (2), and (3) and in-5 serting "shall state in a clear and conspicuous man-6 ner"; and 7 (2) by adding at the end the following flush 8 sentence: "For purposes of this subsection, a com-9 munication does not make a statement in a clear 10 and conspicuous manner if it is difficult to read or 11 hear or if the placement is easily overlooked.". 12 (b) Special Rules for Qualified Internet or DIGITAL COMMUNICATIONS.— 13 14 (1) IN GENERAL.—Section 318 of such Act (52) 15 U.S.C. 30120) is amended by adding at the end the 16 following new subsection: 17 "(e) Special Rules Qualified Internet or Dig-ITAL COMMUNICATIONS.— 18 19 "(1) Special rules with respect to state-20 MENTS.—In the case of any qualified internet or 21 digital communication (as defined in section 22 304(f)(3)(D)) which is disseminated through a me-23 dium in which the provision of all of the information 24 specified in this section is not possible, the commu-

nication shall, in a clear and conspicuous manner—

| 1 | "(A) state the name of the person who |
|----|---|
| 2 | paid for the communication; and |
| 3 | "(B) provide a means for the recipient of |
| 4 | the communication to obtain the remainder of |
| 5 | the information required under this section with |
| 6 | minimal effort and without receiving or viewing |
| 7 | any additional material other than such re- |
| 8 | quired information. |
| 9 | "(2) Safe harbor for determining clear |
| 10 | AND CONSPICUOUS MANNER.—A statement in quali- |
| 11 | fied internet or digital communication (as defined in |
| 12 | section 304(f)(3)(D)) shall be considered to be made |
| 13 | in a clear and conspicuous manner as provided in |
| 14 | subsection (a) if the communication meets the fol- |
| 15 | lowing requirements: |
| 16 | "(A) TEXT OR GRAPHIC COMMUNICA- |
| 17 | TIONS.—In the case of a text or graphic com- |
| 18 | munication, the statement— |
| 19 | "(i) appears in letters at least as large |
| 20 | as the majority of the text in the commu- |
| 21 | nication; and |
| 22 | "(ii) meets the requirements of para- |
| 23 | graphs (2) and (3) of subsection (c). |
| 24 | "(B) Audio communications.—In the |
| 25 | case of an audio communication, the statement |

| 1 | is spoken in a clearly audible and intelligible |
|----|---|
| 2 | manner at the beginning or end of the commu- |
| 3 | nication and lasts at least 3 seconds. |
| 4 | "(C) VIDEO COMMUNICATIONS.—In the |
| 5 | case of a video communication which also in- |
| 6 | cludes audio, the statement— |
| 7 | "(i) is included at either the beginning |
| 8 | or the end of the communication; and |
| 9 | "(ii) is made both in— |
| 10 | "(I) a written format that meets |
| 11 | the requirements of subparagraph (A) |
| 12 | and appears for at least 4 seconds; |
| 13 | and |
| 14 | "(II) an audible format that |
| 15 | meets the requirements of subpara- |
| 16 | graph (B). |
| 17 | "(D) OTHER COMMUNICATIONS.—In the |
| 18 | case of any other type of communication, the |
| 19 | statement is at least as clear and conspicuous |
| 20 | as the statement specified in subparagraphs |
| 21 | (A), (B), or (C).". |
| 22 | (2) Nonapplication of Certain excep- |
| 23 | TIONS.—The exceptions provided in section |
| 24 | 110.11(f)(1)(i) and (ii) of title 11, Code of Federal |
| 25 | Regulations, or any successor to such rules, shall |

| 1 | have no application to qualified internet or digital |
|----|--|
| 2 | communications (as defined in section 304(f)(3)(D) |
| 3 | of the Federal Election Campaign Act of 1971). |
| 4 | (c) Modification of Additional Requirements |
| 5 | FOR CERTAIN COMMUNICATIONS.—Section 318(d) of such |
| 6 | Act (52 U.S.C. 30120(d)) is amended— |
| 7 | (1) in paragraph (1)(A)— |
| 8 | (A) by striking "which is transmitted |
| 9 | through radio" and inserting "which is in an |
| 10 | audio format"; and |
| 11 | (B) by striking "BY RADIO" in the heading |
| 12 | and inserting "AUDIO FORMAT"; |
| 13 | (2) in paragraph (1)(B)— |
| 14 | (A) by striking "which is transmitted |
| 15 | through television" and inserting "which is in |
| 16 | video format"; and |
| 17 | (B) by striking "By Television" in the |
| 18 | heading and inserting "VIDEO FORMAT"; and |
| 19 | (3) in paragraph (2)— |
| 20 | (A) by striking "transmitted through radio |
| 21 | or television" and inserting "made in audio or |
| 22 | video format"; and |
| 23 | (B) by striking "through television" in the |
| 24 | second sentence and inserting "in video for- |
| 25 | mat'' |

SEC. 8. POLITICAL RECORD REQUIREMENTS FOR ONLINE 2 PLATFORMS. 3 (a) IN GENERAL.—Section 304 of the Federal Election Campaign Act of 1971 (52 U.S.C. 30104) is amended 4 5 by adding at the end the following new subsection: 6 "(j) Disclosure of Certain Online Advertise-7 MENTS.— 8 "(1) IN GENERAL.— 9 "(A) REQUIREMENTS FOR ONLINE PLAT-10 FORMS.—An online platform shall maintain, 11 and make available for online public inspection 12 in machine readable format, a complete record 13 of any request to purchase on such online plat-14 form a qualified political advertisement which is 15 made by a person whose aggregate requests to 16 purchase qualified political advertisements on such online platform during the calendar year 17 18 exceeds \$500. 19 "(B) REQUIREMENTS FOR ADVER-20 TISERS.—Any person who requests to purchase 21 a qualified political advertisement on an online 22 platform shall provide the online platform with 23 such information as is necessary for the online 24 platform to comply with the requirements of

subparagraph (A).

| 1 | "(2) Contents of Record.—A record main- |
|----|--|
| 2 | tained under paragraph (1)(A) shall contain— |
| 3 | "(A) a digital copy of the qualified political |
| 4 | advertisement; |
| 5 | "(B) a description of the audience targeted |
| 6 | by the advertisement, the number of views gen- |
| 7 | erated from the advertisement, and the date |
| 8 | and time that the advertisement is first dis- |
| 9 | played and last displayed; and |
| 10 | "(C) information regarding— |
| 11 | "(i) the average rate charged for the |
| 12 | advertisement; |
| 13 | "(ii) the name of the candidate to |
| 14 | which the advertisement refers and the of- |
| 15 | fice to which the candidate is seeking elec- |
| 16 | tion, the election to which the advertise- |
| 17 | ment refers, or the national legislative |
| 18 | issue to which the advertisement refers (as |
| 19 | applicable); |
| 20 | "(iii) in the case of a request made |
| 21 | by, or on behalf of, a candidate, the name |
| 22 | of the candidate, the authorized committee |
| 23 | of the candidate, and the treasurer of such |
| 24 | committee; and |

| 1 | "(iv) in the case of any request not |
|----|--|
| 2 | described in clause (iii), the name of the |
| 3 | person purchasing the advertisement, the |
| 4 | name, address, and phone number of a |
| 5 | contact person for such person, and a list |
| 6 | of the chief executive officers or members |
| 7 | of the executive committee or of the board |
| 8 | of directors of such person. |
| 9 | "(3) Online platform.—For purposes of this |
| 10 | subsection, the term 'online platform' means any |
| 11 | public-facing website, web application, or digital ap- |
| 12 | plication (including a social network, ad network, or |
| 13 | search engine) which— |
| 14 | "(A) sells qualified political advertise- |
| 15 | ments; and |
| 16 | "(B) has 50,000,000 or more unique |
| 17 | monthly United States visitors or users for a |
| 18 | majority of months during the preceding 12 |
| 19 | months. |
| 20 | "(4) Qualified political advertisement.— |
| 21 | "(A) In general.—For purposes of this |
| 22 | subsection, the term 'qualified political adver- |
| 23 | tisement' means any advertisement (including |
| 24 | search engine marketing, display advertise- |

| 1 | ments, video advertisements, native advertise- |
|----|---|
| 2 | ments, and sponsorships) that— |
| 3 | "(i) is made by or on behalf of a can- |
| 4 | didate; or |
| 5 | "(ii) communicates a message relating |
| 6 | to any political matter of national impor- |
| 7 | tance, including— |
| 8 | "(I) a candidate; |
| 9 | "(II) any election to Federal of- |
| 10 | fice; or |
| 11 | "(III) a national legislative issue |
| 12 | of public importance. |
| 13 | "(5) Time to maintain file.—The informa- |
| 14 | tion required under this subsection shall be made |
| 15 | available as soon as possible and shall be retained by |
| 16 | the online platform for a period of not less than 4 |
| 17 | years. |
| 18 | "(6) Penalties.—For penalties for failure by |
| 19 | online platforms, and persons requesting to purchase |
| 20 | a qualified political advertisement on online plat- |
| 21 | forms, to comply with the requirements of this sub- |
| 22 | section, see section 309.". |
| 23 | (b) Rulemaking.—Not later than 90 days after the |
| 24 | date of the enactment of this Act, the Federal Election |
| 25 | Commission shall establish rules— |

| 1 | (1) requiring common data formats for the |
|----|---|
| 2 | record required to be maintained under section |
| 3 | 304(j) of the Federal Election Campaign Act of |
| 4 | 1971 (as added by subsection (a)) so that all online |
| 5 | platforms submit and maintain data online in a com- |
| 6 | mon, machine-readable and publicly accessible for |
| 7 | mat; and |
| 8 | (2) establishing search interface requirements |
| 9 | relating to such record, including searches by can- |
| 10 | didate name, issue, purchaser, and date. |
| 11 | (c) Reporting.—Not later than 2 years after the |
| 12 | date of the enactment of this Act, and biannually there |
| 13 | after, the Chairman of the Federal Election Commission |
| 14 | shall submit a report to Congress on— |
| 15 | (1) matters relating to compliance with and the |
| 16 | enforcement of the requirements of section 304(j) or |
| 17 | the Federal Election Campaign Act of 1971, as |
| 18 | added by subsection (a); |
| 19 | (2) recommendations for any modifications to |
| 20 | such section to assist in carrying out its purposes |
| 21 | and |
| 22 | (3) identifying ways to bring transparency and |
| | |

accountability to political advertisements distributed

online for free.

23

| 1 | SEC. 9. PREVENTING CONTRIBUTIONS, EXPENDITURES, |
|----|--|
| 2 | INDEPENDENT EXPENDITURES, AND DIS- |
| 3 | BURSEMENTS FOR ELECTIONEERING COM- |
| 4 | MUNICATIONS BY FOREIGN NATIONALS IN |
| 5 | THE FORM OF ONLINE ADVERTISING. |
| 6 | Section 319 of the Federal Election Campaign Act |
| 7 | of 1971 (52 U.S.C. 30121) is amended by adding at the |
| 8 | end the following new subsection: |
| 9 | "(c) Each television or radio broadcast station, pro- |
| 10 | vider of cable or satellite television, or online platform (as |
| 11 | defined in section 304(j)(3)) shall make reasonable efforts |
| 12 | to ensure that communications described in section 318(a) |
| 13 | and made available by such station, provider, or platform |
| 14 | are not purchased by a foreign national, directly or indi- |
| 15 | rectly.". |

 \bigcirc