

116TH CONGRESS
1ST SESSION

H. R. 4311

To protect consumers from discriminatory State taxes on motor vehicle rentals.

IN THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES

SEPTEMBER 12, 2019

Mr. COHEN (for himself and Mr. CHABOT) introduced the following bill; which was referred to the Committee on the Judiciary

A BILL

To protect consumers from discriminatory State taxes on motor vehicle rentals.

1 *Be it enacted by the Senate and House of Representa-*
2 *tives of the United States of America in Congress assembled,*

3 **SECTION 1. SHORT TITLE.**

4 This Act may be cited as the “End Discriminatory
5 State Taxes for Automobile Renters Act of 2019”.

6 **SEC. 2. FINDINGS; PURPOSE.**

7 (a) FINDINGS.—Congress finds the following:

8 (1) Congress has prohibited economic protec-
9 tionism by State and local governments that unduly
10 burden or discriminate against interstate commerce

1 and transportation under the authority granted by
2 the Commerce Clause of the Constitution by enact-
3 ing laws such as the Railroad Revitalization and
4 Regulatory Reform Act of 1976, the Motor Carrier
5 Act of 1980, the Bus Regulatory Reform Act of
6 1982, and the Airport and Airway Improvement Act
7 of 1982.

8 (2) In *Gibbons v. Ogden*, 22 U.S. 1 (1824), a
9 case challenging the exclusive right of navigating the
10 waters of New York granted by that State, the Su-
11 preme Court affirmed that it is the sole right of
12 Congress to regulate commerce between the States
13 under what Chief Justice John Marshall recognized
14 as the dormant Commerce Clause.

15 (3) Since 1990, over 100 discriminatory taxes
16 have been imposed by State and local governments
17 on motor vehicle rentals in violation of the dormant
18 Commerce Clause.

19 (b) PURPOSE.—The purpose of this Act is to prohibit
20 prospectively, and provide a remedy for, tax discrimination
21 by a State or Locality against the rental of motor vehicles.

22 **SEC. 3. PROHIBITION ON DISCRIMINATION.**

23 (a) IN GENERAL.—Chapter 805 of title 49, United
24 States Code, is amended by adding at the end the fol-
25 lowing:

1 **“§ 80505. Tax discrimination against motor vehicle**
2 **rental property**

3 “(a) DEFINITIONS.—In this section:

4 “(1) ASSESSMENT AND ASSESSMENT JURISDIC-
5 TION.—

6 “(A) ASSESSMENT.—The term ‘assess-
7 ment’ has the meaning given that term in sec-
8 tion 11501(a)(1).

9 “(B) ASSESSMENT JURISDICTION.—The
10 term ‘assessment jurisdiction’ has the meaning
11 given that term in section 11501(a)(2).

12 “(2) COMMERCIAL AND INDUSTRIAL PROP-
13 ERTY.—The term ‘commercial and industrial prop-
14 erty’ means property, other than motor vehicle rent-
15 al property and land used primarily for agricultural
16 purposes or timber growing, which is devoted to a
17 commercial or industrial use.

18 “(3) COMMERCIAL AND INDUSTRIAL TAX-
19 PAYERS.—The term ‘other commercial and indus-
20 trial taxpayers’ means persons of entities who are
21 engaged in a trade or business, other than the trade
22 or business of renting motor vehicles, within a State
23 or Locality.

24 “(4) COVERED PERSON.—The term ‘covered
25 person’ means a person who—

1 “(A) rents motor vehicles to another per-
2 son;

3 “(B) is engaged in the business of renting
4 motor vehicles;

5 “(C) owns motor vehicle rental property;

6 “(D) rents a motor vehicle from another
7 person; or

8 “(E) purchases motor vehicle rental prop-
9 erty.

10 “(5) DISCRIMINATORY TAX.—The term ‘dis-
11 criminatory tax’ includes the following:

12 “(A) A tax discriminates against the rental
13 of motor vehicles if a State or Locality imposes
14 the tax on, or with respect to—

15 “(i) the rental of motor vehicles but
16 the tax is not a generally applicable tax on,
17 or with respect to, more than 51 percent of
18 the rentals of other tangible personal prop-
19 erty within the State or Locality; or

20 “(ii) the rental of motor vehicles at a
21 tax rate that exceeds the generally applica-
22 ble tax rate on at least 51 percent of the
23 rentals of other tangible personal property
24 within the same State or Locality.

1 “(B) A tax discriminates against the busi-
2 ness of renting motor vehicles if a State or Lo-
3 cality imposes the tax on, or with respect to—

4 “(i) the business of renting motor ve-
5 hicles but the tax is not a generally appli-
6 cable tax on, or with respect to, more than
7 51 percent of the businesses of other com-
8 mercial and industrial taxpayers within the
9 State or Locality; or

10 “(ii) the business of renting motor ve-
11 hicles at a tax rate that exceeds the gen-
12 erally applicable tax rate on at least 51
13 percent of the business of commercial and
14 industrial taxpayers within the State or
15 Local jurisdiction.

16 “(C) A tax discriminates against motor ve-
17 hicle rental property if a State or Locality—

18 “(i) assesses motor vehicle rental
19 property at a value that has a higher ratio
20 to the true market value of the property
21 than the ratio of the assessed value to the
22 true market value applicable to commercial
23 and industrial property in the same assess-
24 ment jurisdiction;

1 “(ii) levies or collects a tax on an as-
2 sessment that may not be made under
3 clause (i); or

4 “(iii) levies or collects an ad valorem
5 property tax on motor vehicle rental prop-
6 erty at a generally applicable tax rate that
7 exceeds the tax rate applicable to commer-
8 cial and industrial property in the same as-
9 sessment jurisdiction.

10 “(6) LOCAL OR LOCALITY.—The terms ‘Local’
11 and ‘Locality’ mean a political subdivision of any
12 State, or any governmental entity or person acting
13 on behalf of such Locality, with the authority to im-
14 pose, levy, or collect taxes.

15 “(7) MOTOR VEHICLE.—The term ‘motor vehi-
16 cle’ has the meaning given that term in section
17 13102(16).

18 “(8) MOTOR VEHICLE RENTAL PROPERTY.—
19 The term ‘motor vehicle rental property’ means
20 property owned or used by a person engaged in the
21 business of renting motor vehicles and used to pro-
22 vide rentals of motor vehicles.

23 “(9) RENTAL OF MOTOR VEHICLES.—The term
24 ‘rental of motor vehicles’ means the rental of a
25 motor vehicle that is given by the owner of the

1 motor vehicle for exclusive use to another for not
2 longer than 180 days for valuable consideration and
3 only includes the rental of motor vehicles with a pre-
4 arranged driver or motor vehicles without a driver,
5 but shall not include taxi cab service as defined by
6 section 13102(22).

7 “(10) RENTAL OF OTHER TANGIBLE OR PER-
8 SONAL PROPERTY.—The term ‘rental of other tan-
9 gible or personal property’ means any rental of tan-
10 gible or personal property, other than the rental of
11 motor vehicles.

12 “(11) STATE.—The term ‘State’ means any of
13 the several States, the District of Columbia, or any
14 territory or possession of the United States, or any
15 governmental entity or person acting on behalf of
16 such State, and with the authority to impose, levy,
17 or collect taxes.

18 “(12) TAX.—Except as otherwise specifically
19 provided below, the term ‘tax’ means any type of
20 charge required by statute, regulation, or agreement
21 to be paid or furnished to a State or Locality, re-
22 gardless of whether such charge is denominated as
23 a tax, a fee, or any other type of exaction. The term
24 ‘tax’ does not include any charge imposed by a State
25 or Locality with respect to a concession agreement

1 at a federally assisted airport (provided the agree-
2 ment does not violate the revenue diversion provi-
3 sions of section 40116(d)), or the registration, li-
4 censing, or inspection of motor vehicles, if the
5 charge is imposed generally with respect to motor
6 vehicles, without regard to whether such vehicles are
7 used in the business of renting motor vehicles within
8 the State or Locality.

9 “(13) TAX BASE.—The term ‘tax base’ means
10 the receipts, income, value, weight, or other measure
11 of a tax to which the rate is applied. The ‘tax base’
12 of a tax imposed on a per unit basis is the unit.

13 “(14) GENERALLY APPLICABLE TAX.—The
14 term ‘generally applicable tax’ may be determined
15 by—

16 “(A) the gross receipts of rentals of other
17 tangible personal property or other commercial
18 and industrial taxpayers within the State or Lo-
19 cality to which the tax is imposed by the State
20 or Locality compared to the gross receipts of
21 rentals of other tangible personal property or
22 other commercial and industrial taxpayers with-
23 in the State or Locality; or

24 “(B) another method used to determine
25 whether more than 51 percent of rentals of

1 other tangible personal property or other com-
2 mercial and industrial taxpayers is subject to
3 the tax.

4 “(b) UNREASONABLE BURDENS AND DISCRIMINA-
5 TION AGAINST INTERSTATE COMMERCE.—

6 “(1) IN GENERAL.—The following acts unrea-
7 sonably burden and discriminate against interstate
8 commerce, and a State or Locality may not do any
9 of them:

10 “(A) Levy or collect a discriminatory tax
11 on the rental of motor vehicles.

12 “(B) Levy or collect a discriminatory tax
13 on the business of renting motor vehicles.

14 “(C) Levy or collect a discriminatory tax
15 on motor vehicle rental property.

16 “(2) EXCLUSION.—Discriminatory taxes are
17 not prohibited under this section if the tax is im-
18 posed as of the date of the enactment of this section,
19 does not lapse, the tax rate does not increase, and
20 the tax base for such tax does not change.

21 “(c) REMEDIES.—

22 “(1) IN GENERAL.—Notwithstanding section
23 1341 of title 28, a covered person aggrieved of a vio-
24 lation of subsection (b) may bring a civil action in
25 a district court of the United States seeking dam-

1 ages, injunctive relief, other legal or equitable relief,
2 or declaratory relief.

3 “(2) RELIEF.—In granting relief against a tax
4 levied or collected in violation of subsection (b), if
5 the tax is a discriminatory tax the court shall strike
6 only the discriminatory or excessive portion of the
7 tax.

8 “(3) BURDEN OF PROOF.—

9 “(A) IN GENERAL.—Except as provided in
10 subparagraph (B), a covered person shall have
11 the burden of proving, by a preponderance of
12 the evidence, that the levying or collecting of a
13 tax violates subsection (b).

14 “(B) EQUIVALENT OF OTHER TAXES.—If
15 the court determines that the levying or col-
16 lecting of a tax violates subsection (b), the
17 State or Locality shall have the burden of prov-
18 ing, by a preponderance of the evidence, that
19 the tax is the equivalent of a tax imposed on
20 other commercial and industrial taxpayers
21 under paragraph (2).

22 “(4) OTHER REMEDIES.—Nothing in this sub-
23 section shall limit any cause of action or remedy
24 available under any other provision of Federal or
25 State law.

1 “(d) LIMITATIONS.—This section shall not be con-
2 strued to constitute the consent of Congress to State or
3 Local taxation that would be prohibited in the absence of
4 this section.”.

5 (b) CLERICAL AMENDMENT.—The table of sections
6 for chapter 805 of title 49, United States Code, is amend-
7 ed by inserting after the item relating to section 80504
8 the following:

“80505. Tax discrimination against motor vehicle rental property.”.

